Evaluating Information

Jennifer Holland
Travis Jones
Susan Steele
Research & Instruction Librarians

PSYC 1100
First-Year Seminar

Evaluating Information

Elements of Thought. [http://www.criticalthinking.org/ctmodel/logic-model1.htm](http://www.criticalthinking.org/ctmodel/logic-model1.htm); accessed 8-5-2014
FCT Intellectual Standards
Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity

Accuracy

Precision

Relevance

Depth

Breadth

Logic

Significance

Fairness

Sufficiency/Completeness

You want to find out tonight’s show times for a movie at your local theater. Which information source would you choose?

A. Paper version of Houston Chronicle newspaper
B. Online ticket source like Fandango
C. A friend who saw a movie last week
D. The academic journal Film History
E. I’m not sure
FCT Intellectual Standards
Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness

FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness

Purpose
FCT Intellectual Standards
Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness

Process
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness

Authority
Purpose

Inform
Persuade
Sell
Entertain
Inform  
Persuade  
Sell  
Entertain

---

### MOVIES NOW PLAYING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MOVIE TITLE</th>
<th>RATING</th>
<th>FAN RATINGS</th>
<th>TOMATO TOMATOES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THE NUN (2018) REVIEW</td>
<td>★★★★★</td>
<td>8,696</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRAZY RICH ASIANS REVIEW</td>
<td>★★★★★</td>
<td>15,650</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEPPERMINT (2018) REVIEW</td>
<td>★★★★★</td>
<td>3,882</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

https://www.fandango.com; accessed 9-17-2018
Editorial: Campaign for women in STEM unnecessary

BY ALEX PATRICK
GUEST CONTRIBUTOR

A university professor just received a $1.8 million grant to study why women do not pursue careers in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) fields. The end goal is to boost the number of women in the field. However, this is a waste of time—and $1.8 million.

The topic of the gender gap in STEM fields has been much ballyhooed recently. According to the National Girls Collaborative Project (NGCP), women earned only 43.1 percent of Bachelor’s degrees in mathematics and statistics, 19.2 percent of degrees in engineering and 18.2 percent of degrees in computer sciences. While more women than men attend and graduate from college, they avoid these fields en masse.

But is this such a bad thing?
Editorial: Campaign for women in STEM unnecessary

BY ALEX PATRICK
GUEST CONTRIBUTOR

A university professor just received a $1.8 million grant to study why women do not pursue careers in Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) fields. The end goal is to boost the number of women in the field. However, this is a waste of time—and $1.8 million.

The topic of the gender gap in STEM fields has been much ballyhooed recently. According to the National Girls Collaborative Project (NGCP), women earned only 43.1 percent of Bachelor’s degrees in mathematics and statistics, 19.2 percent of degrees in engineering and 18.2 percent of degrees in computer sciences. While more women than men attend and graduate from college, they avoid these fields en masse.

But is this such a bad thing?
Inform
Persuade
Sell
Entertain
Inform
Persuade
Sell
Entertain
Inform
Persuade
Sell
Entertain

Dear Kitten: The Forbidden Water Bowl

Purina Friskies

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RAxElNM-Dmg&list=PLHZZojDg7cOAV317Y1jF_T9V5NRCU1uiZ; accessed 9-26-2017
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness

Process
You want to know where to find a mobile food truck that your friend recommended.

**Which information source would you choose?**

A. A review in an alternative weekly newspaper, like *Houston Press*
B. Reviews on a site like Yelp
C. The food truck’s recent Twitter posts
D. The academic journal *Anthropology of Food*
E. I’m not sure
You want to find out what happened in the White House last week. Which information source would you choose?

A. A news magazine like *Time*, *Newsweek*, or *U.S. News & World Report*
B. A book about politics like Bob Woodward’s *Fear*
C. Today’s Twitter activity by a Houston civic activist
D. The academic journal *American Politics Research*
E. I’m not sure
You want to find research about the effect of government regulations on the pharmaceutical industry.

Which information source would you choose?

A. A news magazine like *Time*, *Newsweek*, or *U.S. News & World Report*

B. Website of an industry group like Pharmaceutical Manufacturers of America

C. An academic journal like *Journal of Pharmaceutical Innovation*

D. I’m not sure
Research process: On what basis does the source rest its claims?

https://flic.kr/p/84U61A
https://flic.kr/p/9Ag4Bp
https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/3/38/Full_Scale_Wind_Tunnel_(NASA_Langley).jpg
Editorial process: What review does the source undergo before publishing?
Time and the Information Creation Process

https://flic.kr/p/5bEzce
Process and Social Media

Schedule for tomorrow:

9 a.m. — shuttles start
10 a.m. — student event starts
11 a.m. — OEA program starts
1:30 p.m. — Senate goes into session
3 p.m. — House goes into session

#OKwalk4kids #TogetherWeAreStronger #oklaed

https://twitter.com/okea/status/981356964709126144
https://twitter.com/grahambrewer/status/981228829053214720

Finally to a place with internet reception. In my give or take 4 or 5 years covering the Oklahoma capitol in some form, I have never seen anywhere near that amount of civic participation. A truly stunning sight. #oklaedwalkout

https://twitter.com/grahambrewer/status/981228829053214720
Process and Social Media

Jason Michael
@jeggit

Believe it or not, this is a shark on the freeway in Houston, Texas. #HurricaneHarvy

Chi Like Da Flatiron
@lpraisewomen

This same shark be at every hurricane

derek schwartz @derek_mafs
Believe it or not, this is a shark on the freeway in Wrightsville Beach, North Carolina. #HurricaneFlorence #FlorenceHurricane2018

https://twitter.com/jeggit/status/902048241646280704
https://twitter.com/lpraisewomen/status/1040610473895489536
Process and Social Media

IF YOU COULD FACT-CHECK BEFORE YOU POST IT

THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

This same shark be at every hurricane

Believe it or not, this is a shark on the freeway in Wrightsville Beach, North Carolina.
#HurricaneFlorence #FlorenceHurricane2018

Show this thread

9:37 AM · Sep 14, 2018

42.1K Retweets 137.1K Likes
“What I hope we see long term is just a movement in this state — in the country really — to give everyone a better chance. The American Dream is getting to the point where it’s unachievable for so many people,” said Craig Hoxie, a Booker T. Washington High School physics teacher.

Each day, marchers have received an outpouring of support from the community they’re in or passing through. Rockholt clutched a note written by a Bristow student. Dinner Thursday — like almost all meals — was donated, and there were plenty of leftovers.
Fact Check, PLEASE!
Robert L. Kerr: The Oklahoma teacher's walkout creates a unique opportunity for a new tactic from our next governor

By Robert L. Kerr  Jun 3, 2018

First came this spring's teacher rallies at the Capitol and national television audiences coming to know Oklahoma as the place schools can't afford to stay open all week, and students use duct-taped, Reagan-era textbooks. Then came the anti-tax lobby's petition to roll back the Legislature's education funding response. And in a few more weeks, primaries will start winnowing down the crowd of aspiring candidates for the state's next governor.

Maybe it all brings together a historic opportunity for one of those candidates to hitch his or her wagon to a bold idea for cutting through all the noise and making a real difference in the state's future.

Robert L. Kerr teaches media law and history at the University of Oklahoma.

'This is where I need to be': Teachers struggle for funding, progress on Day 4 of march Saturday

Educators struggle for funding, progress on fourth day of march to Capitol

By Samuel Hardiman Tulsa World  Apr 7, 2018

Staff Writer Samuel Hardiman

BIO
Samuel joined the Tulsa World in September 2015 and wrote about business for the Work & Money section. He now covers Tulsa Public Schools and education news. Phone: 918-581-8490
school movement was most active in areas where enrollment rates were already high, and that “the reform movement attained its greatest immediate success in the triumph of New England public schools over the flourishing private alternatives” rather than in raising educational levels. L. G. West argues “we lack firm evidence to show education was not already universal prior to the establishment of laws to provide a schooling that was both compulsory and free.” Claudia Goldin and Lawrence Katz summarize historians’ work on New York and Massachusetts and conclude that enrollment rates were similar even though the timing of the free school laws that outlawed private rate bills differed by 41 years. That being the case, why did voters choose to fully fund primary education?

1 Fishlow, “Common School Revival.”
2 West, Education.
3 Goldin and Katz, “Virtues of the Past.”
4 For details, see the histories in Cremin, American Education; Cubberley, History of Education; Kaestle, Pillars of the Republic; Goldin, “Brief History”; and Goldin and Katz, “Virtues of the Past.”

Today, developed countries universally fund public primary education. However, this was not always true. In England, the United States, Prussia, France, and other countries, many children were educated in a thriving private sector before the establishment of fully tax-supported public primary schools. Even in areas of the United States where schools received public support, parents often paid substantial tuition charges, known as rate bills. In the average state in 1850, these private contributions accounted for about 20 percent of public school funds.

During this period, high fractions of children attended primary school and were literate. For example, Albert Fishlow states that the common
The Prediction of States’ PK-12 Funding Effort and Distribution Based on Their Ideological Makeups

Joel R. Malin

ABSTRACT
States differ markedly in their funding for public schools, both in terms of the fiscal effort their citizens demonstrate and the progressivity with which funds are distributed. Yet, less is known about why different states have enacted such different policies and financing systems. In this study, the relationships between a measure of states’ ideological makeups and two PK-12 funding outcome measures, effort and distribution, are examined. Citizen ideology was found to relate strongly and positively to school funding effort, such that more progressive states showed significantly more effort. In contrast, the relationship between citizen ideology and school funding distribution was non-significant. Policy implications of these findings are discussed.

INTRODUCTION
In the United States, because the U.S. Constitution grants no authority over education to the federal government, the operation and funding of PK-12 education is a state responsibility (Crampton, 2007). As a result, 50 separate state funding systems have emerged and evolved, and they vary markedly. It is understood, for instance, that states vary in the degree to which they demonstrate financial support toward public education (funding effort; Alexander, Salmon, and Alexander 2015) and the progressivity with which they distribute funds (for funding distribution; Baker, Sciarr, and Farrie 2010, 2014). However, little is known about why different states have taken such differing approaches, which is concerning: Public school financial resources, and their distribution, carry

DATA AND METHODS
This study’s analytical approach was to use correlational, bivariate ordinary least squares (OLS) linear regression, and hierarchical OLS multivariate regression modeling to examine the relationships between average citizen ideology and school funding effort and distribution. Regression-based approaches were selected for their ability to examine predictive relationships among variables, and to simultaneously control for covariates. Hierarchical OLS multiple linear regression modeling was utilized because it makes it possible to: (a) evaluate the explained variation in the outcome variable as control measures are included, and evaluate their significance as predictors, (b) evaluate whether explained variation improved significantly as the independent variable is added, (c) evaluate whether the second step significantly improved over the first, and (d) comment on the pattern of significance of individual factors in both models.

Dependent Variables
This study included two dependent variables, studied separately. The first, school funding effort, was calculated as follows:

\[
\text{PK-12 Funding Effort} = \frac{\text{State and Local Revenues/Average Daily Attendance}}{\text{Per Capita Personal Income}}
\]

REFERENCES
Peer Review in 3 Minutes

http://youtu.be/rOCQZ7QnoN0
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity
Accuracy
Precision
Relevance
Depth
Breadth
Logic
Significance
Fairness
Sufficiency/Completeness

Authority
Authority Defined:

• Oxford English Dictionary (OED): A person whose opinion or testimony is **accepted as true**
FCT Intellectual Standards

Clarity

Accuracy

Precision

Relevance

Depth

Breadth

Logic

Significance

Fairness

Sufficiency/Completeness

Regarding Authority exercise

• Think of an authority figure in your life (1 minute)
• Pair up with a classmate and describe your authority figures (1-2 minutes)
• Share your observations with the class (1 minute)
Expertise & Specialized Knowledge
Expertise & Specialized Knowledge
Firsthand Experience

Firsthand Experience
Evaluating authority

Recruiting and Hiring Women in STEM Fields

Christy Glass
Utah State University

Krista Lynn Minnotte
University of North Dakota

The number of women earning advanced degrees in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) has increased, yet women remain underrepresented in the ranks of the academic hierarchy in these fields. To help explain this pattern, we explored mechanisms in the recruitment and hiring process at the level of the department that hinder or promote the hiring of women into tenure-track positions. We analyzed a unique data set of the entire pool of applicants to tenure-track STEM positions over a 6-year period at a large public research university, where we found that universities and academic departments can use increasing representation in tenure-track positions, including placing greater emphasis on increasing the number of women applicants and placing advertisements that specifically target women.

Keywords: recruitment, hiring, women, faculty, STEM

In recent years, the number of women earning advanced degrees in the STEM fields (science, engineering, technology, and mathematics) has increased, yet women remain underrepresented in the ranks of the academic hierarchy in these fields. To help explain this pattern, we explored mechanisms in the recruitment and hiring process at the level of the department that hinder or promote the hiring of women into tenure-track positions. We analyzed a unique data set of the entire pool of applicants to tenure-track STEM positions over a 6-year period at a large public research university, where we found that universities and academic departments can use strategies to increase the representation of women in tenure-track positions, including placing greater emphasis on increasing the number of women applicants and placing advertisements that specifically target women.

The authors contributed equally to this article. For convenience, they are listed in alphabetical order. This research was supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant SBE-0244922.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Christy Glass, Department of Sociology, Social Work and Anthropology, Utah State University, Logan, UT 84322. E-mail: Christy.glass@usu.edu
Robert L. Kerr: The Oklahoma teacher's walkout creates a unique opportunity for a new tactic from our next governor

By Robert L. Kerr  Jun 3, 2018

First came this spring’s teacher rallies at the Capitol and national-television audiences coming to know Oklahoma as the place schools can’t afford to stay open all week, and students use duct-taped, Reagan-era textbooks. Then came the anti-tax lobby’s petition to roll back the Legislature’s education funding response. And in a few more weeks, primaries will start winnowing down the crowd of aspiring candidates for the state’s next governor.

Maybe it all brings together a historic opportunity for one of those candidates to hitch his or her wagon to a bold idea for cutting through all the noise and making a real difference in the state’s future.
Robert L. Kerr - University of Oklahoma


Refereed Publications


Books


Law Reviews

Determining authority

Which community?

Academia
Arts & Culture
Religion
Family
Hobbies
Other?
Authority & Process

Process

Authority
Authority & Purpose

Authority

Purpose
Part One -- Individual work:

- Read your assigned information scenario
- Using the worksheet provided, read/skim the information source assigned to you -- focus on its intended audience, process, and authority in terms of how suitable they are for your scenario.
- Answer the questions on the worksheet.

Part Two -- Group work:

- Others in your group will have the same scenario but will have examined a different information source.
- Tell your group members about the information source you examined and how you responded to the questions on the worksheet.
- Based on your group’s analysis of purpose, process, and authority for your scenario, rank the four information sources from most appropriate/suitable to least appropriate/suitable.
- Have someone post the group’s ranking on the chalkboard with most appropriate on top and least appropriate on the bottom.

Part Three -- Class discussion.

Information Sources:

Access your ASSIGNED information source below, and complete the corresponding worksheet.

- Block - Code Like a Girl
  (blog article, yellow worksheet)
- Mims - Wall Street Journal
  (newspaper commentary, green worksheet)
- Scott et al. - Tech Leavers
  (research study report, pink worksheet)
- Wynn & Correll - Social Studies of Science
  (scholarly journal article, blue worksheet)
Elements of Thought

- Information: data, facts, observations, experiences
- Reasoning: reasons, evidence

- Concepts: theories, definitions, axioms, laws, principles, models
- Interpretation and Inference: conclusions, solutions
- Assumptions: presupposition, taking for granted
- Implications and Consequences
- Point of View: frame of reference, perspective, orientation
- Purpose: goal, objective
- Question at issue: problem, issue
Intellectual Standards

Clear
Accurate
Relevant/Significant
Fair
Sufficient/Complete
Logical
Precise
Deep
Broad
Intellectual Traits

• persistent
• fair-minded
• places confidence in reason
• acts with integrity